

Music's

INTELLECTUAL HISTORY

EDITED BY

ZDRAVKO BLAŽEKOVIĆ
BARBARA DOBBS MACKENZIE

RÉPERTOIRE INTERNATIONAL DE LITTÉRATURE MUSICALE
NEW YORK 2009

© 2009 by Répertoire International de Littérature Musicale

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any other information storage or retrieval system without the prior permission of the publisher.

The book is edited according to *How to write about music: The RILM manual of style* (2nd ed., New York, 2006).

Répertoire International de Littérature Musicale
International Repertory of Music Literature
Internationales Repertorium der Musikliteratur

RILM International Center
City University of New York, The Graduate Center
365 Fifth Avenue
New York, NY 10016
Voice: (212) 817-1990
Fax: (212) 817-1569
rilm@rilm.org
<http://www.rilm.org>

Printed in the United States of America.
ISBN: 978-1-932765-05-2

Cover image: Library of the Franciscan Monastery of St. Francis in Šibenik, Croatia
Cover image photographer: Damir Fabijanić
Cover and front matter designer: Fred Gates Design

Text layout and designer: J. Graeme Fullerton
Editor of French articles: Desmond Hosford
Conference administrator: Michele Smith
Printer and binder: Hamilton Printing Company

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

CONTENTS

PREFACE xi

PERSONALITIES: MUSIC SCHOLARS

RUTH I. DEFORD, Sebald Heyden (1499–1561): The first historical musicologist?	3
JUAN JOSÉ PASTOR COMÍN, Musical transmission of Garcilaso de la Vega’s poems in Cervantes’s texts	17
PHILIPPE VENDRIX, To write historically about music during the 16th century: Pietro Gaetano.	33
WALTER KURT KREYSZIG, “Leopold Mozart... a man of much... sagacity”: The revival of humanist scholarship in his <i>Gründliche Violinschule</i> (Augsburg, 1756)	43
EDWARD GREEN, The impact of Rousseau on the histories of Burney and Hawkins: A story in the ethics of musicology	157
THEODORE ALBRECHT, Anton Schindler as destroyer and forger of Beethoven’s conversation books: A case for decriminalization	169
ANNA HARWELL CELENZA, Music history as reflected in the works of Hans Christian Andersen.	183
SANNA F. PEDERSON, An early crusader for music as culture: Wilhelm Heinrich Riehl	195
ZDRAVKO BLAŽEKOVIĆ, Franjo Ksaver Kuhač (1834–1911) and the beginnings of music scholarship in Croatia	203
TIMOTHY FLYNN, Camille Saint-Saëns musicologist? Effects, influence, and traditions	235
ANTONIO LOVATO, The Cecilian movement and musical historiography in Italy: The contribution of Angelo De Santi	241
BÉRENGÈRE DE L’ÉPINE & PAULINE GIRARD, <i>Léo Delibes</i> by Henri de Curzon: A stereotypical biography of a French musician in the early 20th century	251
ANNA MARIA BUSSE BERGER, The origins of the agenda of medieval musicology: Friedrich Ludwig and Jacques Handschin	261
RÉMY CAMPOS, The founding of French musicology: Looking around Pierre Aubry’s workshop (1896–1910)	291
FLORENCE GÉTREAU, Curt Sachs as a theorist for music museology	303
ANDRÉ BALOG, “Those unheard are sweeter...”? Hungarian music and musicians in the 20th century: An incomplete history	315

ENNIO STIPČEVIĆ, Music historiography and <i>terra incognita</i> : The case of Dragan Plamenac	327
LÓRÁNT PÉTERI, God and revolution: Rewriting the absolute. Bence Szabolcsi and the discourse of Hungarian musical life	337
ANDREAS VEJVAR, Orpheus in the jungle: Constructing music history in a novel	343
BEATRIZ MAGALHÃES-CASTRO, Robert Stevenson’s Iberian world connections: Haydn and interconnected music histories in Latin American studies.	353

PERSONALITIES: COMPOSERS

MARK BURFORD, Nationalism, liberalism, and commemorative practice: A tale of two 19th-century Bach editions	367
DAVID HUNTER, Writing a nation’s musical taste: Hawkins, Burney, and the popularization of Händel in the first histories of music	377
ILIAS CHRISOCHOIDIS, Handel’s reception and the rise of music historiography in Britain	387
HEATHER PLATT, Hugo Wolf and the “evolution” of the lied	397
SABINE FEISST, Schoenberg in America reconsidered: A historiographic investigation . .	409
VALÉRIE DUFOUR, Stravinsky stratège? Le compositeur face à l’exégèse de son œuvre en Europe (1926–34).	427
RACHEL BECKLES WILLSON, Reconstructing Ligeti	443

NATIONAL STUDIES

XAVIER BISARO, Entre instrumentalisation et sécularisation: L’historiographie du plain-chant de Nivers à Lebeuf	451
CÉCILE REYNAUD, “The judgment of Paris”: Evaluations by the Académie des Beaux-Arts of works by winners of the Prix de Rome (1803–ca.1840)	465
STEFAN MORENT, Viewing the past: Differing concepts of early music history in 19th-century Germany and France	473
JAMES DEAVILLE, The Allgemeine Deutsche Musikverein: Forming German national identity through new music	481
IVANO CAVALLINI, The rise of music historiography in Italy in the second half of the 19th century: Between positivism and evolutionism	495
MARCO DI PASQUALE, The music of the Italian Renaissance as a national myth	503

SANJA MAJER-BOBETKO, The founders of Croatian music historiography: Music, history, politics, and ideology	515
SINDHUMATHI K. REVULURI, Harmonizing the past	525
FRÉDÉRIC LEMMERS, Les traductions d'opéras au travers de l'enregistrement sonore: Quatre enregistrements de a sérénade de Don Juan dans quatre traductions françaises différentes	533
KAREN AHLQUIST, A matter of faith: Intellectual history, institutional governance, and musicians' education in the early–20th-century USA	545
CLEVELAND JOHNSON, The first All-India Music Conferences and the advent of modern Indian musicology	551
TIMOTHY J. COOLEY, How 19th-century musical folklore created Poland's Górale diaspora in 20th-century Chicago.	559
LYNN HOOKER, Ideas about "Hungarian music" in early Hungarian musicology.	565
MICHAEL B. BECKERMAN, Nettie Quinn's guide to nationalism in music	581
BEATE KUTSCHKE, Musicology and the force of political fiction: The debate on politically engaged music at the beginning of the 1970s	583
MARIN MARIAN-BĂLAȘA, Communist ethnomusicology and the formation and growth of nationalist ethnocentrism	593
LUANA STAN, Constructing policies of image and identity: The local and the global in Romanian musicology after the Second World War	599
JAMES MELO, Macunaíma out of the woods: The intersection of musicology and ethnomusicology in Brazil	607
NIELS KRABBE, <i>Den europæiske musikkulturs historie</i> (1982–84) and its ideological and academic background	615
MARTIN LODGE, Music historiography in New Zealand	625
DANIËL G. GELDENHUYS, Enlightening a continent: The legacy of a music history in Africa.	633

ENCYCLOPEDIAS

NICO SCHÜLER, Hugo Riemann's <i>Musik-Lexikon</i> as a mirror of German music history.	643
MELITA MILIN, The place of small musical cultures in reference books	653
PHILIP EWELL, Russia's <i>New Grove</i> : Priceless resource or propagandistic rubbish?	659
URVE LIPPUS, A man and his portraits: The image of Gustav Ernasaks in (Soviet) writings on music.	671

PERIODICALS

ROBIN WALLACE, <i>The Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung</i> : Cradle of modern musicology . . .	685
CAROL PADGHAM ALBRECHT, Leipzig's <i>Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung</i> and the Viennese Classical canon.	707
TATJANA MARKOVIĆ, Intertextual relations between the Serbian and Viennese concepts of 19th-century music periodicals.	719
MICHEL DUCHESNEAU, <i>La revue musicale</i> (1920–40) and the founding of a modern music	743
DANICK TROTTIER, Towards a topology of aesthetic discussion contained in <i>La revue musicale</i> of the 1920s	751
MARIE-NOËLLE LAVOIE, Dance in Henry Prunières's <i>La revue musicale</i> (1920–40): Between the early and the modern	761

HISTORIOGRAPHY & ITS DIRECTIONS

NICHOLAS COOK, Changing the musical object: Approaches to performance analysis . . .	775
DANIEL LEECH-WILKINSON, Musicology and performance	791
JAMES R. COWDERY, <i>Kategorie</i> or <i>Wertidee</i> ? The early years of the International Folk Music Council.	805
JAMES ROBERT CURRIE, Music's context: Genealogical and political considerations . . .	813
ZBIGNIEW GRANAT, Rediscovering "sonoristics": A groundbreaking theory from the margins of musicology	821
VANESSA HAWES, Numbering fetishism: The history of the use of information theory as a tool for musical analysis	835
JOLANTA T. PEKACZ, Musical biography—Further thoughts	843
MICHAEL SAFFLE, Musicology and fiction	853

AUTHOR BIOGRAPHIES	885
INDEX.	893

PREFACE

For almost 45 years RILM has been abstracting and indexing the publications of hundreds of thousands of scholars from countries around the world—scholars who write on every kind of music and who follow myriad directions in music scholarship. The result has been the continual growth of *RILM abstracts of music literature*, RILM's central publication and primary *raison d'être*. In addition to our efforts to keep up with current literature, the *RILM retrospectives* series assures coverage of some key document types from the past, including, most recently, conference proceedings and *Festschriften* honoring music scholars. Together this retrospective coverage and RILM's current bibliography form a foundation supporting scholarly research and fostering the interplay and development of ideas and concepts, with the ultimate goal of furthering intellectual discourse on music.

In addition to laying solid groundwork for scholarship, there is another result of this endeavor that may not leap so readily to mind: In working with the world's music literature for many years at the RILM International Center, one begins to gain an overview of the world's scholarly output on music. Participating in the gradual, record-by-record construction of a kind of bibliographic mountain enables fascinating views from the top, so to speak. From this vantage point, currents and trends become visible. A historiographic overview begins to come into focus.

This perspective jumped out at us particularly in our work on *Speaking of music: Music conferences, 1835–1966* (2004), volume 4 in the *RILM retrospectives* series. The volume begins with the earliest paper on music presented at the first Congrès Historique Européen and ends the year before RILM's current bibliography's coverage begins. *Speaking of music* points to a multitude of topics discussed at nearly 500 conferences; its chronology provides an engrossing picture of music scholarship and its evolution over the past two centuries, reflecting countless currents of thought from the mid-19th to the mid-20th century—the heyday of Romanticism, the advent of modernism, the rise and fall of Marxism, and the emergence of multiculturalism, to name just a few. One sees how the center and the peripheries of activity have shifted among countries, how different topics have come into vogue and then been forgotten, how individual effort has gradually given way to institutionalized research, and how ideas that occupied particular scholars of the past changed at various moments in their careers.

As such, *Speaking of music* provides a particularly revealing window on intellectual history through the prism of music, and it inspired the idea that RILM should organize a conference on music historiography as a forum for the scholarly investigation of the many ideas presented in its bibliography. The conference—Music's Intellectual History:

Founders, Followers, and Fads (held from 16 through 19 March 2005 at The Graduate Center of The City University of New York)—resonated in the scholarly community; 100 scholars from around the world presented papers over the course of these four days, far more than we had anticipated, and a fascinating kaleidoscope of studies, viewpoints, ideas, and opinions emerged. It was our first conference, and it was so successful, and the presentations were so insightful, that we realized the natural partnership of RILM and historiographic investigation. It became clear to us that RILM has unique perspectives and materials to offer to the field of historiography.

Hence the inauguration herewith of the new *RILM perspectives* series, which is devoted to selected proceedings of RILM conferences. The current volume, containing 66 articles that started as presentations at the 2005 conference, disseminates the scholarship presented there. It spans an immense range of topics, views, and ideas that, together, provide an essential cornerstone of music studies, indicating the directions the discipline has taken in the past, revealing the precedents for current scholarly habits, and suggesting future paths for further pursuits. The articles are grouped into the following sections:

PERSONALITIES: MUSIC SCHOLARS profiles historical figures starting with the 16th-century Nuremberg theorist Sebald Heyden and the Venetian historian Pietro Gaetano; followed by Leopold Mozart, Jean-Jacques Rousseau, Charles Burney, and John Hawkins in the 18th century; Anton Schindler, Hans Christian Andersen, Wilhelm Heinrich Riehl, Franjo Ksaver Kuhač, Camille Saint-Saëns, and Angelo De Santi in the 19th century; and culminating with the founding figures of modern music scholarship, from Henri de Curzon, Friedrich Ludwig, Jacques Handschin, Pierre Aubry, and Curt Sachs to Dragan Plamenac, Bence Szabolcsi, and Robert Stevenson.

PERSONALITIES: COMPOSERS offers new perspectives on the reception history of Bach, Händel, Wolf, Schoenberg, Stravinsky, and Ligeti.

NATIONAL STUDIES explores historiographic issues pertaining to the music histories of Africa, Brazil, Croatia, Denmark, France, Germany, Hungary, India, Italy, New Zealand, Romania, and the United States.

ENCYCLOPEDIAS presents methodological topics and the main lexicographical efforts of the 20th century in Germany, the Soviet Union, and the United Kingdom.

PERIODICALS analyzes the significance of the German *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, the Serbian *Gusle*, and the French *La revue musicale*.

HISTORIOGRAPHY AND ITS DIRECTIONS brings research on performance history into focus, analyzes struggles in defining the term *folk music* in the mid-20th century, considers the vogue of context studies, explores the creation and use of sonoristics and information theory in music analysis, discusses methods in writing musical biography, and examines the relationship between musicology and fiction.

It is our happy duty to thank some of those who made this volume and its related conference possible. The Graduate Center of The City University of New York has supported RILM from its infancy; it assisted RILM's efforts again by providing the venue and technical assistance for the 2005 conference. Thanks are due particularly to The Graduate Center's President, William P. Kelly, as well as to the Vice President for Research and Sponsored Programs, Brian Schwartz, for their participation and encouragement. Our neighbors in the Music Department at The Graduate Center have also helped RILM's efforts over all these years. Claire Brook has been the most determined supporter of events organized by both RILM and the Barry S. Brook Center for Music Research and Documentation, the umbrella organization of projects housed at The Graduate Center. We are grateful also to RILM's sponsoring organizations—the International Musicological Society; the International Association of Music Libraries, Archives, and Documentation Centres; and the International Council for Traditional Music—as well as to the members of its Commission Internationale Mixte for their steadfast encouragement. And special recognition is due to the tireless J. Graeme Fullerton, RILM's Production Editor, who designed the page layout and typeset the volume, and implemented countless revisions to the text over many months.

And lastly but most importantly, to all the scholars who contributed articles published herein, we thank you for your contributions. The quality and depth of research make us especially proud to be the editors of such fine work.

“Performance shifts all the time; scholarship has to change by revolutions or hardly at all.” (Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, p. 803) We invite you to read about some of these revolutions and attempted revolutions in the following pages.

ZDRAVKO BLAŽEKOVIĆ
BARBARA DOBBS MACKENZIE